

RESENHA CRÍTICA DO LIVRO:

Barcellos, Lia Rejane Mendes (org.). *Musicoterapia: transferência, contratransferência e resistência*. Rio de Janeiro: Enelivros, 1999.

BARCELLOS, LIA REJANE MENDES (org.). *Music Therapy: Transference, Countertransference and Resistance*. Enelivros: São Paulo, 1999.

André B. Mattos

109

In the early 90's, I had my first contact with music therapy through a workshop that was taught by two respected professionals in Brazil: Cecília Conde, music educator; and Lia Rejane Mendes Barcellos, music therapist and author of the current book. Cecilia Conde, to whom Lia Rejane has dedicated her book, was the owner of Conservatório Brasileiro de Música which became one of the major centers for music therapy training in Brazil. The theoretical foundations of this training program were influenced by the backgrounds of its coordinators: Cecilia Conde and Doris Hoyer de Carvalho. Cecilia was a Jungian professor and Carvalho a Humanist one. Lia Rejane completed her studies at Conservatório Brasileiro de Música in 1975.

The author's idea for this book began when she received, from the United States, a journal containing several articles that were presented in 1992 during the "21st Anniversary Conference". This was a celebration of the former "American Association for Music Therapy", organized by New York University (NYU). Those articles had something in common: they discussed the phenomena of transference and countertransference in music therapy. This was something very unique in comparison to the Brazilian publications at that time.

Besides studying each article, Lia Rejane started the process of translating them, aiming to use them as contents in the Graduate Program she had created in 1993. One of the main characteristics of those articles was the fact that each one was discussing the subject following a certain theoretical foundation or a specific aspect of certain theoretical model. The author asked permission for the American Association for Music Therapy, which was

approved, and the book was finally published during the 2nd Music Therapy Latin American Meeting by Enelivros Publishers (Rio de Janeiro), in 1998. The forward author is the Brazilian music therapist Marco Antônio Carvalho Santos.

Chapter one presents an article, written by the music therapist Louise Montello, and is entitled “The Transference in the Music Therapy Relationship”. The main goal of Montello was to explore the phenomenon of transference in a psychodynamic context. The writer’s influences come from theories of Melanie Klein and D. W. Winnicott for whom the act of “play” is a significant therapeutic medium. Based on Klein’s idea that in playing the child is able to symbolically express his/her unconscious conflicts, Montello details some clinical examples.

Chapter two was written by the Danish music therapist Benedikte Barth Scheiby and is called “Musical Transferences and Countertransferences”. The author initiates her article expressing her perception that music seems to be a third element in the relationship. According to Scheiby, Mary Priestley could really understand the essential role of music involved in transference and countertransference.²⁹ Scheiby believes that transference occurs as soon as the first interaction between client and therapist happens and, once it happens, the relationship can develop and grow. She thinks that music therapy offers the opportunity for the therapist to use his/her musical countertransference as a mirror and a key in order to better understand the unconscious dynamic of the client. She finally describes some clinical examples demonstrating how musical transference and countertransference operate³⁰.

Chapter three was written by Pamela H. Steele and is entitled “Aspects of the Resistance in Music Therapy: Theory and Technique”. The article aims to reflect on the concept of resistance and illustrates the phenomenon in a clinical work with a three year old boy. Steele worked at St. Thomas’ Children’s Psychiatric Day Hospital, in London, with children with developmental disorders. She states what I would consider a very controversial musical metaphor in order

²⁹ Scheiby uses the terms “musical transference” and “musical countertransference” (p. 25). She states that she uses these terms understanding that the phenomena carry different meanings of those in psychotherapy without music. According to her the phenomena become alive as an artistic *Gestalt*.

³⁰ IN: Barcellos, 1999, pp 25-40.

to better describe her idea of resistance. She says: “the relationship between therapist and client can be considered consonant or dissonant.”³¹ According to her, the dissonance would have to do with an inadequate relationship between the two agents (therapist and client) which would be caused by the child’s resistance. Steele’s point of view makes me raise some questions: what would be consider dissonance nowadays? Why would dissonance be considered inadequate and consonance adequate? I would think that it can be related to an old understanding that dissonances sounded bad and it is important to remember that the reviewed book was published fourteen years ago. One of the greatest contributions of Bossa Nova for Brazilian and world music, for example, was the addition of dissonances (major7, 9th, 11th, 13rd, minor6/9 among others). Even though these tones are considered dissonances they are totally accepted in Brazilian music nowadays. Therefore, it does not seem that the metaphor used by the author is appropriate to describe what she intends to describe. She also writes about the techniques she uses in order to work on resistance³² through a clinical case description.

Chapter four is called “Considerations about Matters of Development and Interventions Choices in order to deal with Resistance in Music Therapy”, by Janice M. Dvorkin. The author starts her article stating that forms of resistance have been seen as important phenomena in psychoanalytical work. She identifies Ralph Greenson as being one of the pioneers in thinking about the importance of better understanding resistance in therapy. To explain transferential resistance, she cites the work of Winnicott about true and false selves. According to Winnicott the false self, established by the client, is influenced by the relationship with others. It can occur in the therapeutic process influenced by the relationship with the therapist, according to Dvorkin. She considers this phenomenon some sort of mechanism that helps the client to be more stable. In order to illustrate the way she works these concepts in music therapy, Dvorkin describes briefly a process with a client.

³¹ IN: Barcellos, 1999, p 42.

³² Ibid., pp. 41-56.

Chapter five was written by four authors: Niki L. Delk, Elizabeth Leidolf, Stephanie Jones and Ted Jordan. Their article was entitled “Creativity, Resistance and Chemical Abuse according to a Humanistic Perspective in Music Therapy”. These authors open the article stating their understanding that music therapy, in essence, is a humanist practice once deals with a therapist helping a person to feel better, to keep or to recover a well being state. They understand music as a mechanism which allows the individual to explore him/herself in a non-verbal way and believe that the process of growing can be painful. Their theoretical influences are Maslow, May and Zinker. They believe, for instance, that music is able to promote peak experiences and self actualizations. Also, they state that creativity and psychotherapy are connected since these two processes involve transformation, change. The purpose of the article is to discuss difficulties that people encounter to change in therapy. The authors do not use the word resistance but the dilemma a client may face between being attracted by the comfort zone (safe area) versus the drive to grow.

Chapter six is called “Energy, Resistance and Transformation with Music and Creative Fantasy” and was written by the music therapist Kenneth Aigen. In the beginning of the article, the author quotes Anna Freud’s idea about resistance. According to her, “resistance is a direct force *against* the emerge of the unconscious and, consequently, against the work of the analyst.”³³ As opposed to this Freud’s thought, Aigen believes that resistance cannot be considered something “wrong” that needs to be avoided, but as a normal and expected phenomenon to happen. To better explain his idea, he uses the metaphor of an electric resistance that is activated in a machine, from time to time, in order to regulate force. Aigen believes that it is possible to understand psychological resistance as a certain degree of personality structure, that belongs to each person, which helps to regulate the flow of psychic energy. Therefore, resistance is not something negative but it has, in fact, an essential role for the psychic health. Finally, the author illustrates the work with resistance

³³ IN: Barcellos, 1999, p. 71.

through a clinical case. He used a created song aiming to stimulate the client on his transformational tendencies and connection with his self.

The author of chapter seven is Diane Austin who entitled her article “Self songs: Improvised Singing in Jungian Analytical Music Therapy”. Austin has a strong Jungian influence in her work. And she defines it as a creative process that uses music and words in a relationship between client/therapist in order to facilitate constant dialogues among the conscious and unconscious contents. She adds that creativity was essential for the work of Carl Gustav Jung who also believed that in working with symbols, in multiple creative ways, it would be possible for people to expand their realities, to find creative solutions in order to solve problems³⁴. Austin follows the analytical understanding of transference, countertransference and resistance associated with analytical psychology’s concepts of collective unconscious, complexes and archetypes. According to the Jungian theory, parts of the self are directly related to complexes and complexes are considered centers which carry a number of ideas and associated images. In the core of the complex there is something called archetype which is a transpersonal and universal pattern of meaning and psychic experience. In order to illustrate her theory, Austin finally describes a clinical case of a person having difficulties in terms of investing what she calls energy required for development and “cure.”³⁵ With the objective of helping her client, then, to use the required energy which controls and denies necessities, she intervened with a therapeutic technique called “Free Singing Association” which aims to create a solid and stable musical container which stimulates the client to sing. Austin believes that music facilitates the process of individuation and that in singing a person is able to deeply access him/her self.

Finally, the last chapter was written by the author of the book, Lia Rejane Mendes Barcellos, and was entitled “Transference, Countertransference and Resistance in the Bonny Method – Guided Music and Imagery (GIM)”. The author writing is in her 1st language. The author starts her article with a brief

³⁴ Ibid., p. 75.

³⁵ Ibid., p. 77.

summary about GIM's history what she considers important before talking about transference, countertransference and resistance. She affirms that Helen Bonny, founder of the Method, was largely influenced by the philosopher of music Victor Zuckerkandl. According to Barcellos, transference in GIM occurs towards three objects: therapist, client and music. Related to countertransference, she believes that it is a phenomenon that occurs through a therapist listening to a client and that in GIM can be activated by a different event, situation, action or feeling that comes from the client and leads the therapist to some sort of reaction. In talking about resistance, Barcellos agrees with Bruscia when he says that resistance is not negative but a healthy possibility for the client to defend him/herself from some threat.

As one of the positive aspects of the book, Lia Rejane Mendes Barcellos tried to provide to the reader a variety of thoughts in terms of transference, countertransference and resistance. And it is done in a diverse way having sometimes thoughts contradicting each other providing an interesting possibility for reflection. As an example, Steele (on chapter 3) considers the client's resistance as a dissonance, meaning something inadequate whereas for Bruscia, Barcellos (chapter 8) and Aigen (chapter 6), resistance can be considered part of an expected client's healthy movement in therapy.

The book was published in 1999 and even though it is old, it is still the only book written in Portuguese which discusses these phenomena specifically directed to music therapy. The book is addressed to Brazilian music therapy scholars and students. When reading it, one must be aware that even though Barcellos' intention was to have professionals representing different models and thoughts about the phenomena, each writer will describe his/her own ideas about the role transference, countertransference and resistance have in the music therapy dynamic. And ideas about these phenomena can vary from music therapist to music therapist even though they may follow the same model.

A South American music therapist can be disappointed for not finding more examples of local practices and thoughts being described in the book as a

contribution with the presented authors. South American music therapy has an enormous influence of psychodynamic models therefore it would be expected that more Brazilian, Argentinian and Uruguayan music therapists would be invited to add examples of clinical works and thoughts. It was in the 80's that Rolando Benezon began to publish articles and books about music therapy and also discussing these dynamic aspects involved.

Barcellos' book can be considered one of the starting points of discussing the phenomena of transference, countertransference and resistance in music therapy in South America. The reader, then, can increase his/her knowledge about the theme reading these authors more in depth. Barcellos' book is easy to be read containing a variety of writing styles which makes it engaging. It is rich and broad offering to the community an opportunity to reflect about several perspectives in terms of human being, health, therapy, therapeutic relationship, dynamic and music. In doing it the book accomplishes its goal – which was to bring to the Brazilian community a broader discussion about different ways of understanding the roles and the importance of transference, countertransference and resistance in music therapy.

REFERENCE

Barcellos, Lia Rejane Mendes. **Musicoterapia:** transferência, contratransferência e resistência. Rio de Janeiro: Enelivros, 1999.